INTRODUCTION
Different Texts, Different Versions

> To the one God, prayers and praises are to be employed with one and the same formula.
>
> —Pope Pius V (1568)[1]

In the spring of 2009, I found myself in Santa Fe for the annual conference of the Rocky Mountain Council for Latin American Studies. One night while at dinner with a few other Latin American scholars the conversation turned, as it frequently does, to the individual courses we were currently teaching and the curriculum assigned. I was amazed at the variety of textbooks, novels, and secondary and primary sources the group assigned to their classes. The historical topics each of us chose to emphasize throughout our surveys similarly varied and reflected our individual preferences as scholars. Although we were all teaching Latin American history, each one of us presented our classes with distinct versions of that history so that, in the end, what Latin American history meant to my students surely differed from what it meant to the students of another instructor.

The same paradigm can be applied to colonial Catholicism. How Catholicism was presented to the Nahuas and Mayas, and what version of the religion the natives received largely depended on the preferences of their instructors, and the religious texts they composed and used. Each religious text presented Catholicism in its own way, thus diversifying the Catholic message. Indeed, rarely did two Nahuatl or Maya texts contain identical messages or interpretations of the religion. Moreover, the diversification evident between texts of the same language becomes even more apparent when examined across cultural divides. Nahuatl and Maya religious texts all preached Catholicism to be sure, but different versions of Catholicism. The purpose of this book is to illustrate how Nahuatl and Maya religious texts both prescribed and reflected various forms of Catholicism throughout colonial central Mexico and Yucatan.

[1] *Breviarium Romanum* (1568; Vatican City: Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2000), 3.

In so doing, this study illustrates the roles that Nahuas, Mayas, and Spaniards played in the creation and promulgation of diverse Catholicisms.

HISTORIOGRAPHIC CONTEXT AND OBJECTIVES OF THIS BOOK

Within the study of religion in colonial Mesoamerica, the use of native-language religious texts largely appears in the growing body of scholarship that contests Robert Ricard's thesis of a "Spiritual Conquest."[2] When Ricard published his *Conquête Spirituelle du Mexique* in 1933, he employed mendicant accounts to present a monolithic view of the Church that lauded both its successful expansion and its victory over the unorthodox practices of Mexico. Yet more recent studies question the conversion of the natives and the successful elimination of their pre-contact beliefs. Indeed, scholars began to search both Spanish and native-language sources to reveal the presence of a continually negotiated "mixed religion" in Mesoamerica whose inhabitants were far from spiritually conquered.[3]

The failure of colonial natives to practice an orthodox Christianity was once blamed on their inability to understand Catholic discourse and not on the discourse itself.[4] However, in the process of examining and reexamining the spiritual conquest, scholars began to recognize the role of native-language religious texts in illustrating how a variety of interpretations of Catholicism emerged. Leading the way, Louise Burkhart's *The Slippery Earth* greatly con-

[2] Robert Ricard, *The Spiritual Conquest of Mexico: An Essay on the Apostolate and the Evangelizing Methods of the Mendicant Orders in New Spain: 1523–72*, trans. Lesley Byrd Simpson (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1966).

[3] Manuel Gamio and his students provided the original foundation for this term in the 1920s and 1930s. See, for example, Anita Brenner, *Idols behind Altars* (New York: Payson and Clarke, Ltd., 1929). See also Miguel León-Portilla, "Testimonios nahuas sobre la conquista espiritual," *Estudios de cultura Náhuatl* 11 (1974), 11–36; J. Jorge Klor de Alva, "Spiritual Conflict and Accommodation in New Spain: Toward a Typology of Aztec Response to Christianity," in *Inca and Aztec States*, ed. George A. Collier, Renato I. Rosaldo, and John D. Wirth (New York: Academic Press, 1982); Louise M. Burkhart, *The Slippery Earth: Nahua–Christian Moral Dialogue in Sixteenth-Century Mexico* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1989). More broadly, see Charles Gibson, *The Aztecs Under Spanish Rule: A History of the Indians of the Valley of Mexico 1519–1810* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1964); James Lockhart, *The Nahuas after the Conquest: A Social and Cultural History of the Indians of Central Mexico, Sixteenth through Eighteenth Centuries* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1992). For a few of many additional examples, see Georges Baudot, "Fray Andrés de Olmos y su tratado de los pecados morales en lengua náhuatl," *Estudios de Cultura Náhuatl* 12 (1976), 33–59; Charles Dibble, "The Nahuatlization of Christianity," in *Sixteenth-Century Mexico: The Work of Sahagún*, ed. Munro S. Edmonson (Albuquerque:University of New Mexico Press, 1974).

[4] For the beginnings of such an argument, see Bernal Díaz del Castillo, *The Bernal Díaz Chronicles: The True Story of the Conquest of Mexico*, ed., trans. Albert Idell (New York: Doubleday & Company, Inc., 1956), 147.

tributed to the recognition of how Christian moral dialogue in Nahuatl religious texts became indigenous, and sometimes unorthodox, through its translation into and use of Nahuatl rhetoric.[5] In a case of what James Lockhart describes as "double mistaken identity," the use of indigenous vocabulary and rhetoric loaded with precontact meaning to represent Christian concepts would result in both Spaniards and natives giving the text their own interpretations without taking "cognizance of the other side's interpretation."[6]

Yet Christian concepts "lost in translation" were not the only contributors to colonial Catholicism's unorthodox interpretation. Sometimes the Catholic doctrine that ecclesiastical texts delivered to natives was simply incorrect. The important Nahuatl Theater project (2004–2009) examining a number of Nahuatl religious dramas illustrates how at times native playwrights took great liberties with events in Christian history, or even doctrine, to increase their appeal and familiarity to a Nahua audience, even if such liberties "bordered on the sacrilegious."[7]

While the study of Nahuatl and Maya religious texts is gradually attracting more scholars, few studies take full advantage of these works. As mentioned, Nahuatl religious dramas have received excellent attention, but only a small number of works examine the wealth of other religious texts.[8] Fewer still are

[5] Burkhart, *Slippery Earth*.

[6] Lockhart, *The Nahuas*, 445.

[7] Stafford Poole, C.M., "Introduction: The Virgin of Guadalupe in Two Nahuatl Dramas," in *Our Lady of Guadalupe*, vol. 2 of *Nahuatl Theater*, ed. Barry D. Sell, Louise M. Burkhart, and Stafford Poole (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2006), 14. For more on Nahuatl plays, see Fernando Horcasitas, *El teatro náhuatl: épocas novohispana y moderna* (Mexico City: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, 1974); Louise Burkhart, *Holy Wednesday: A Nahua Drama from Early Colonial Mexico* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1996); Louise Burkhart, *Before Guadalupe: The Virgin Mary in Early Colonial Nahuatl Literature* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 2001); Raúl Macuil Martínez and Guadalupe Alonso Ramírez, *La pasión de Tlatlauhquitepec: Obra de teatro tlaxcalteca en náhuatl del siglo xvi* (Tlaxcala: Instituto Tlaxcalteca de Cultura, 2010); and the Nahuatl Theater series (2004–2009) from the University of Oklahoma Press.

[8] Some more recent exceptions would be Burkhart, *Before Guadalupe*; Burkhart, *Slippery Earth*; Bartolomé de Alva, *A Guide to Confession Large and Small in the Mexican Language, 1634*, ed. Barry D. Sell, John Frederick Schwaller, with Lu Ann Homza (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1999); Barry Sell, "Friars, Nahuas, and Books: Language and Expression in Colonial Nahuatl Publications" (PhD diss., University of California, Los Angeles, 1993); Susanne Klaus, *Uprooted Christianity: The Preaching of the Christian Doctrine in Mexico Based on Franciscan Sermons of the 16th Century Written in Nahuatl*, Bonner Amerikanistische Studien, no. 33 (Bonn: Anton Saurwein, 1999).

Also, to some extent, Barry D. Sell, *Nahua Confraternities in Early Colonial Mexico: The 1552 Ordinances of Fray Alonso de Molina, OFM* (Berkeley, CA: Academy of American Franciscan History, 2002); Viviana Díaz Balsera, *The Pyramid under the Cross: Franciscan Discourses of Evangelization and the Nahua Christian Subject in Sixteenth-Century Mexico* (Tucson: University

studies examining Maya religious texts outside those found within the Chilam Balams (Maya-authored texts combining Maya and European culture).[9] Overall, although scholars have made significant contributions to understanding colonial religion in central Mexico, there are still many elements of the "spiritual conquest" that await revision through the use of native-language religious texts.

For example, the misconception exists of a single "Mexican Catholicism," or "Mexican Christianity." As one scholar stated, "the Catholic Church's popular image of monolithic unity masks its great heterogeneity and its decentralized structure."[10] Much of the existing scholarship focuses on specific Nahuatl religious texts, or other documents, from a specific place within a specific period to uncover what Charles Dibble termed the "Nahuatlization of Christianity." These studies, although important, reveal only single snapshots of insight. Without comparative studies, the spatial and temporal boundaries of these snapshots can spread to the whole of Mesoamerica, or at least Mexico, and the entire colonial period. The threads holding together such a single Catholicism quickly unravel upon expanding the documentary evidence to

---

of Arizona Press, 2005); and Osvaldo F. Pardo, *The Origins of Mexican Catholicism: Nahua Rituals and Christian Sacraments in Sixteenth-Century Mexico* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2004); Jaime Lara, *Christian Texts for Aztecs: Art and Liturgy in Colonial Mexico* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2008); David Tavárez's *The Invisible War: Indigenous Devotions, Discipline, and Dissent in Colonial Mexico* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2011).

For articles and book chapters, see David Tavárez, "Naming the Trinity: From Ideologies of Translation to Dialectics of Reception in Colonial Nahua Texts, 1547–1771," *Colonial Latin American Review* 9, no. 1 (2000); John F. Schwaller, "The Ilhuica of the Nahua: Is Heaven Just a Place?" *The Americas* 62, no. 3 (2006); Mark Z. Christensen, "The Tales of Two Cultures: Ecclesiastical Texts and Nahua and Maya Catholicisms," *The Americas* 66, no. 3 (2010): 353–77; Mark Z. Christensen, "The Use of Nahuatl in Evangelization and the Ministry of Sebastian," *Ethnohistory* 59, no. 4 (2012): 691-711; Berenice Alcántara Rojas, "La Resurrección de Cristo en tres cantares nahuas del siglo XVI: Discurso de evangelización y apropiaciones indígenas del cristianismo," in *Visiones del encuentro de dos mundos en América: lengua, cultura, traducción y trasculturación*, ed. Karen Dakin, Mercedes Montes de Oca, and Claudia Parodi (Mexico City: Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Instituto de Investigaciones Filológicas/Universidad de California en Los Ángeles, 2009).

[9] William Hanks, *Converting Words: Maya in the Age of the Cross* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010). For a few excellent works revealing the religious content of the Chilam Balams, see Timothy Knowlton, *Maya Creation Myths: Words and Worlds of the Chilam Balam* (Boulder: University Press of Colorado, 2010); Victoria R. Bricker and Helga-María Miram, trans., ed., *An Encounter of Two Worlds: The Book of Chilam Balam of Kaua* (New Orleans: Middle American Research Institute, Tulane University, 2002); Timothy Knowlton and Gabrielle Vail, "Dynamics of Indigenous Language Ideologies in the Colonial Redaction of a Yucatec Maya Cosmological Text," *Anthropological Linguistics* 50, no. 1 (Spring 2008): 90–112.

[10] Daniel Levine, *Religion and Politics in Latin America: The Catholic Church in Venezuela and Colombia* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1981), 9.

include published and unpublished texts among various locales and time periods within the colonial era, and incorporating other Mesoamerican cultures such as the Maya. Such an examination places snapshots of insight together to form a collage representing a larger, diverse scene of many Catholicisms extending throughout the colonial period and branching outside central Mexico. A comparative study of Nahuatl and Maya religious texts does not exist. This book endeavors to fill that void.

To do so, this book asks, "What do religious texts reveal of the 'Mayanization of Christianity' and how does it compare with the 'Nahuatlization of Christianity'?" William Hanks's *Converting Words* (2010)—which was published as the manuscript for this book was being submitted—makes significant and important inroads into the use of Maya religious texts.[11] Whereas we share an appreciation for the value of Maya religious texts in contributing to the understanding of the colonial Maya, we differ in our employment of such texts. Hanks primarily uses the texts to examine the spread and use of a religious Maya language, or *lengua reducida*; and I employ a diverse range of Nahuatl and Maya texts to expose their prescription and reflection of various versions of Catholicism.

In addition to illustrating cultural influences on religious texts, this book also explores the doctrinal variation among and between published and unpublished texts of the same language. The excellent works of Burkhart demonstrate how select published and unpublished Nahuatl texts could convey distinct messages.[12] Yet the topic of published and unpublished texts remains in its infancy and requires further analysis into how such texts came about and their role in shaping the Catholic message.[13] Each author—whether Spanish, Nahua, or Maya—composed his version of Catholicism according to his religious training, personal preferences, location, audience, and the era. This allowed, for example, differences among confessional manuals from Mexico City and Guadalajara, testaments from Cacalchen and Ixil, and between catechisms composed in the sixteenth and eighteenth centuries.

[11] Another notable work would be Knowlton's *Creation Myths*. Here, Knowlton compares select doctrinal texts with the creation myths of the Chilam Balam of Chumayel to reveal the dialogic processes that renegotiated "traditional" cosmogonies according to precontact and colonial contexts.

[12] In particular, see Burkhart, *Holy Wednesday*; and Burkhart, *Before Guadalupe*.

[13] Recent and notable works exposing the presence of unpublished Maya texts include Hanks, *Converting Words*; Knowlton, "Dynamics"; and Knowlton, *Creation Myths*. David Tavárez similarly reveals the presence of clandestine texts for the Nahua and Zapotec in his "La idolatría letrada: un análisis comparativo de textos clandestinos rituales y devocionales en comunidades nahuas y zapotecas, 1613–1654," *Historia Mexicana* 49, no. 2 (1999): 197–252; and in his *Invisible War*.

Furthermore, unpublished texts avoided the rigorous editorial process of publishing and could more easily contain material the Church would have considered "heretical." Composed by or with the assistance of native aides, such texts occasionally contained local versions of Catholicism that strayed from the orthodox doctrine of the Church. Unpublished religious texts, then, provide an important glimpse into how local ecclesiastics and Nahua and Maya religious aides interpreted Catholicism. Because the majority of unpublished ecclesiastical texts have either been destroyed, lost to time, or remain hidden in obscure and private archives, their number is unknown. But surely the number exceeded those published, especially in *pueblos de visita*—towns at a distance from colonial metropolises that served as dependencies of *cabeceras*, or head towns.[14] In reality, unpublished, native-language religious texts likely comprised a significant part of the Catholic message (or better messages) that natives heard, and thus warrant increased scholarly attention.

The use of a comparative eye to illustrate religious variation is not new. Scholars have long been aware of the diversity in Christianity and the inability of the Council of Trent to eliminate variations in practice and belief. Indeed, although I frequently reference "Catholicism," I do so with the knowledge that a single Catholicism never truly existed. Consider the differences between Northern European and Southern Mediterranean practices, or the differences between the East and West that eventually led to the Great Schism in the Church. Many excellent studies exist demonstrating the diversity in Europeans' conceptualization of Catholicism from the unofficial to the official, the local to the central.[15] And as Chapter 2 demonstrates, however briefly, European reli-

[14] For an overview of *visitas* and their relationship to the *guardianía*, see Hanks, *Converting Words*, 39–50, 60–63.

[15] Works for Spain are cited below. However, for a sample of the works examining broader Europe, see Carlo Ginzburg, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller*, trans. John Tedeschi and Anne Tedeschi (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980); Carlo Ginzburg, *The Night Battles: Witchcraft and Agrarian Cults in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries*, trans. John Tedeschi and Anne Tedeschi (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1983); Michael P. Carroll, *Veiled Threats: The Logic of Popular Catholicism in Italy* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996); David Gentilcore, *From Bishop to Witch: They System of the Sacred in Early Modern Terra d'Otranto* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1992); Eamon Duffy, *The Stripping of the Altars: Traditional Religion in England, c. 1400–c. 1580* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1992); Sheridan Gilley and Brian Stanley, eds., *World Christianities c. 1815–c. 1914*, vol. 8, *The Cambridge History of Christianity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006). Regarding Spain, William Christian, Henry Kamen, Jaime Contreras, and Sara Nalle all demonstrate the local variations of Catholicism's religious and institutional practice vis-à-vis peripheral and central locations and situations.

gious texts contributed to this diversification. The evolution and change in Catholicism and Christianity as a whole since its conception has likewise received attention from scholars.[16] Yet with the exception of a few recent edited volumes, similar studies examining the diversity of religious belief and practice remain limited in the study of colonial Mesoamerica.[17] As William Christian recently stated, "The study of variation in Catholicism as practiced, historically or in the present, is in its infancy."[18] This book carries Christian's important conversation of Catholicism's diversity to central Mexico and Yucatan.

To be sure, most Latin American scholars would support the idea of a multifaceted Catholicism. Many would likely cite Inquisition cases demonstrating deviant practices to support their supposition. Yet studies providing examples of the norm rather than the exceptional are few. This book attempts to provide a sound documentary foundation for the idea of diverse Catholicisms, both prescribed and experienced, through Nahuatl and Maya texts containing the Christian message. As mentioned, only a select number of studies employ native-language religious texts when examining colonial religion—a dearth intimately connected with the limited number of sources, especially those in languages other than Nahuatl, and the difficulty of translation.[19] However, the heightened inter-

[16] See, for example, William A. Christian, *Local Religion in Sixteenth-Century Spain* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1981); Louis Châtellier, *The Religion of the Poor: Rural Missions in Europe and the Formation of Modern Catholicism, c. 1500–c. 1800* , trans. Brian Pearce (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997); Anneke B. Mulder-Bakker and Jocelyn Wogan-Browne, ed., *Household, Women, and Christianities in Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages* (Turnhout, Belgium: Brepols, 2005). Regarding Spain, see Christian, *Local Religion*; Henry Kamen, *The Spanish Inquisition* (New York: New American Library, 1965); Jaime Contreras, *El santo oficio de la inquisición en Galicia 1560–1700* (Madrid: Akal, 1982); Sara T. Nalle, *Mad for God: Bartolomé Sánchez, The Secret Messiah of Cardenete* (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 2001). Martin Nesvig's *Ideology and Inquisition: The World of the Censors in Early Mexico* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2009) exposes this diversity for colonial Mexico.

[17] Martin Austin Nesvig, ed., *Local Religion in Colonial Mexico* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2006); John F. Schwaller, ed., *The Church in Colonial Latin America* (Wilmington, Del.: Scholarly Resources, 2000); Susan Schroeder and Stafford Poole, eds., *Religion in New Spain* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2007). Another work recognizing local diversity would be Tavárez's *The Invisible War*. William Taylor provides an interesting study of local religious variation in his *Magistrates of the Sacred: Priests and Parishioners in Eighteenth-Century Mexico* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1996). For the modern period, see Martin Austin Nesvig, ed., *Religious Culture in Modern Mexico* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2007).

[18] William A. Christian, "Catholicisms," in *Local Religion*, 263.

[19] Regarding the Andes, works examining religious texts in Quechua are even more sparse if not entirely nonexistent. A notable exception is Alan Durston's *Pastoral Quechua: The History of Christian Translation in Colonial Peru, 1550–1650* (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2007). Another exception among works examining the Philippines is

est in native-language texts in recent years has made Nahuatl religious texts—primarily testaments—increasingly available, thus augmenting the feasibility of a comparative study among Nahuatl works.[20] Indeed, the comparative study of religious texts of the same native language is a necessary step forward, and one that a small number of scholars have taken and primarily for Nahuatl texts.[21] Yet the subsequent step, the one crossing cultural boarders (in this case into Yucatan), is equally essential.[22] The current work takes these two steps.

This book is divided into three parts. Part One discusses the production of native-language religious texts in central Mexico and Yucatan and their role in creating various versions of Catholicism. Chapter 1 examines the process of creating orthographies and vocabularies in the Roman alphabet from spoken Nahuatl and Yucatec Maya. This section exposes the challenges of translating Christian concepts into indigenous languages, and the role of the friars and their native assistants in overcoming such challenges. The diversification of Catholicism in central Mexico and Yucatan began in the initial stages of composing religious texts with the creation of written languages and vocabularies shaped by culturally- and regionally-specific influences.

Chapter 2 provides new insights into the composition of religious texts, both published and unpublished, and their colonial messages—messages natives received and, at times, delivered. Employing a variety of religious texts, this chapter reveals the concern of many ecclesiastics for orthodoxy and accurate translations, and their attempts to use the printing press to obtain conformity. However, such hopes failed to come to fruition. Not only did published texts differ in their doctrinal instructions, but unofficial unpublished texts continued

---

Vicente L. Rafael's *Contracting Colonialism: Translation and Christian Conversion in Tagalog Society under Early Spanish Rule* (Durham, NC, and London: Duke University Press, 1993). Many religious texts composed in indigenous languages throughout Latin America await translation and examination.

[20] Although notarial in style, testaments also share a religious character. I include testaments in my study of religious texts for their connection to the spiritual well-being of natives, and their ability to impact and reveal how natives engaged Catholicism. For more on testaments, see their discussion as a genre in Chapter 3, and their detailed examination in Chapters 7 and 8.

[21] For some examples of comparative examinations among Nahuatl texts that, among other things, betray such diversity, see Schwaller, "The Ilhuica"; Tavárez, "Naming the Trinity"; Burkhart, *Slippery Earth*; Burkhart, *Holy Wednesday*; Burkhart, *Before Guadalupe*; and the *Nahuatl Theater* series. For the Maya, see Hanks, *Converting Words*.

[22] A pioneering work in taking this step would be Matthew Restall, Lisa Sousa, and Kevin Terraciano, eds., *Mesoamerican Voices: Native-Language Writings from Colonial Mexico, Oaxaca, Yucatan, and Guatemala* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005). Tavárez's *Invisible War* provides a recent example of analyzing Nahuatl and Zapotec texts. René Acuña (1996) also provides textual comparisons in his transcriptions of select Maya texts.

to exist as well. Thus, these native-language religious texts conveyed various official and unofficial versions of Catholicism to Nahuas and Mayas.

This prescription of various Catholicisms becomes evident in Part Two. Chapter 3 considers how Nahuatl and Maya religious texts conveyed the basic tenets of the Catholic faith. The Ten Commandments, the Lord's Prayer, and the Creed appeared in a variety of Nahuatl and Maya texts. Although such doctrines occasionally became obscured through translation, interpretation, and authorial preference, the primary impetus for diversification lay in their explanation and application. This diversification is further seen through Nahuatl and Maya texts and their explanation and application of the doctrines of baptism (Chapter 4) and confession (Chapter 5).

Whereas Part Two primarily illustrates how Nahuatl and Maya religious texts prescribed various versions of Catholicism, Part Three focuses specifically on texts that also reflect such diversity of interpretation and application in the lives of natives. Chapter 6 employs a Nahua sermon on the conversion of Paul and a Maya manuscript relating the creation of Adam to demonstrate how unpublished, unofficial religious texts could offer and reflect unorthodox, culturally shaped versions of Catholicism. Such cultural and local distinctions continue in Chapter 7 with a study of Nahuatl and Maya testaments, and in Chapter 8 with an examination of private and communal relationships with the cult of the saints. Both chapters highlight local, cultural, temporal, and regional differences among and between Nahua and Maya testaments. Chapter 8 additionally examines how differences in testaments' formulaic preambles and bequeathed goods reveal the cult of the saint's diverse impact among central Mexican and Yucatecan indigenous polities.

The sources for this study derive primarily from archival research in Mexico, Spain, and the United States. From such research, and the generosity of other scholars in sharing their finds, I have compiled a cache of Nahuatl and Maya religious texts (see Appendix A). The significant work of previous scholars on Nahuatl and Maya texts—both religious and secular—has greatly facilitated the comparative nature of this study.[23] Spanish documents from official proceedings and correspondence, councils, reports, religious texts, and Inquisition accounts supplement these native-language sources. Although I have cast my documentary net wide, it is not, of course, all-encompassing or exhaustive and future discoveries and research on religious texts will hopefully contribute to the discussion set forth here.

[23] Indeed, if not for the existing translations of myriad native-language texts from *The Bancroft Dialogues* to the Chilam Balams, this book never would have been possible.

Admittedly, the comparative aspect of this study falls vulnerable to some unavoidable limitations. First and foremost, available Nahuatl religious texts vastly outnumber those in Maya. Any scholar with experience in Yucatecan archives could offer a variety of plausible explanations for such a dearth including weather conditions, archival funding, preservation techniques (or lack thereof), and so on. Yet surely the lack of a printing press in Yucatan until 1813, and the loss of Mérida's Franciscan convent, San Francisco de Mérida, played a large role. Regarding the latter, the grandiose convent was a key center of Catholicism in Yucatan. Established in 1547 upon part of Tihó's (Mérida's) largest pyramid, the complex housed up to fifty friars and contained an infirmary and school. For nearly three hundred years the archives of the convent collected priceless texts. Yet when the Franciscans opposed the new Spanish constitution in 1821, local mobs raided the convent, destroying the archives and what must have been countless religious texts in Maya.[24]

To appreciate the enormity of this loss one only need peruse Alfred Tozzer's list of Maya works at the back of his grammar. Next to nearly every entry of a religious text composed in Maya known to Tozzer is the word "missing." Take, for example, the writings of fray Juan Coronel, a prolific seventeenth-century Franciscan. His pupil, Diego López de Cogolludo, reports that Coronel had written a volume of *pláticas* (speeches or sermons), a catechism, and a confessional manual for new ministers.[25] To this list Tozzer adds Coronel's *Discursos predicables* and a second catechism more complete than the original.[26] All but the last two, which are exceedingly rare, are lost.

However, as seen in Appendix A, I have succeeded in locating a sizeable number of Maya religious texts, many of which are manuscripts. Many of these texts are stored in the various archives of Mérida and Campeche where they remain un- or mis-cataloged; thus many lay hidden. Indeed, a good number of the Maya religious texts appearing in this study were the result of a document-by-document search through endless *legajos* (files). In addition, early twentieth-century collectors have endowed various archives throughout the

[24] For an overview of the convent, see Miguel A. Bretos, *Arquitectura y arte sacro en Yucatán, 1545–1823* (Mérida, Mexico City: Producción Editorial Dante, 1987); Miguel A. Bretos, "La provincial de San Joseph de Yucatán: conversion y arquitectura religiosa en el país de los Mayas," *Archivo Ibero-Americano: Revista Franciscana de Estudios Históricos* 53, nos. 209/212 (1993): 67–104; Richard D. Perry and Rosalind W. Perry, *Maya Missions: Exploring Colonial Yucatan* (Santa Barbara, CA: Espadaña Press, 2002), 83–5.

[25] Diego López de Cogolludo, *Historia de Yucatán* (Madrid: J. García Infanzón, 1688), 440.

[26] Alfred M. Tozzer, *A Maya Grammar* (1921; New York: Dover, 1977), 197.

United States with random Maya religious texts. Princeton and Tulane University hold many unique manuscripts, as does the University of Pennsylvania and Brigham Young University. Research in these archives, supplemented with Matthew Restall's own personal collection, resulted in the corpus of Maya religious texts employed here.

Many of the Maya texts are brief manuscripts on specific religious topics. Others were published after Independence. This imbalance of substantive, colonial Maya religious texts vis-à-vis those in Nahuatl, coupled with the diverse genres of religious texts, limits the comparative examination of Catholicism and its diverse conveyance in texts to certain doctrinal concepts. However, this imbalance fails to eliminate the possibility of significant comparisons and insights.

It would be a mistake to assume that ecclesiastical texts represented the sole religious instruction for Nahuas and Mayas. The many undocumented sermons, conversations, and other mundane interactions between native and Church played a large role that eludes the archives. Also, I am aware that any religious text is susceptible to bias, particularly those intended for Spanish eyes, and care is taken throughout the work to indicate when such might be the case. Finally, similar to any participant of a history class who ultimately decides what he/she gleans from the course, so too each individual Nahua and Maya had the ultimate say in what Catholicism meant to them. The transformation of words on a page into beliefs of the heart remains difficult to document, and I do not attempt such here. Yet, as illustrated in Part Three, native-authored religious texts do provide uncommon insights into how Nahuas and Maya interpreted and applied Catholicism. In the end, even with such limitations, the present study aspires to provide a new appreciation for the various Catholicisms that leapt from the pages of Nahuatl and Maya ecclesiastical texts.

DIFFERENT RULES, DIFFERENT TIMES, DIFFERENT TEXTS

Religious texts betray a religious landscape in central Mexico and Yucatan more varied than the texts themselves. In fact, religious texts, among other things, are products of their environment. In the process of employing Nahuatl and Maya religious texts to illustrate how they prescribed and reflected different Catholicisms, this book also uncovers, where possible, morsels of insight into how various elements of this religious landscape influenced the composition, content, and diversity of religious texts. As these nuances remain invisible without context, some brief discussion here on the

colonial Church is warranted, while details on Nahua and Maya culture occur throughout.[27]

Ecclesiastics arrived in central Mexico and Yucatan accompanying the first conquistadors including Francisco Hernández de Córdoba in 1517, Juan de Grijalva in 1518, and Hernán Cortés in 1519. These ecclesiastics derived from two main branches of the Church: the regular clergy (Franciscans, Dominicans, Augustinians, and Jesuits) who followed a *regula* or rule that often included strict guidelines of conduct and vows of poverty, and the secular clergy who lived in the *saeculum*, or world, and took no vow of poverty or of obedience to a set of rules.[28] The regular clergy traditionally served as adjunct to the normal ecclesiastical hierarchy composed exclusively of secular clerics. Typically, a secular clergyman would always take precedent over a regular clergyman of the same rank, and regular clergy were also subject to the authority of the local bishop in their apostolates, but not in their internal life.

However, due to the unusual circumstances presented by the discovery of the New World, regular clerics were allowed a larger role in colonial Latin America than they had in Europe. Seeing conversion as a solution to Spanish-native relations, the Crown and the Pope authorized regular clerics to administer sacraments, fulfill various parochial duties, and, in many instances, function beyond episcopal control to help them in their efforts to convert the native population to Christianity. The secular clergy saw this as a disruption to the traditional parochial structure. Furthermore, as both clergies increased in numbers, competition for provinces and parochial jurisdiction frequently contributed to strained relationships between secular and regular clergy in the sixteenth century.[29] However, as the native population declined, so did the missionary program; this, coupled with other changes of the late sixteenth century, eventually led the Spanish Crown to favor the secular over the regular clergy

[27] Because this is not a work on the history of the Church in colonial New Spain, many details are omitted for brevity. For more detailed overviews, see John F. Schwaller, *The History of the Catholic Church in Latin America: From Conquest to Revolution and Beyond* (New York: New York University Press, 2011), 52–64; and Hernando Ruiz de Alarcón, *Treatise on the Heathen Superstitions That Today Live Among the Indians Native to This New Spain, 1629*, trans., ed. J. Richard Andrews and Ross Hassig (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1984), 3–7.

[28] Each order had a particular emphasis: the Franciscans stressed poverty and humility; the Dominicans were the order of preachers and theologians; the Augustinians were great scholars; and the Jesuits (who arrived in 1570) were intellectuals and associated with a military-like obedience.

[29] Much has been written on this subject, but for a general overview see Robert C. Padden, "The Ordenanza del Patronazgo of 1574: An Interpretative Essay," *The Americas* 12 (1956): 333–54; and John F. Schwaller, "The Ordenanza del Patronazgo in New Spain, 1574–1600," *The Americas* 42, no. 3 (January 1986): 253–74.

and begin the secularization of New Spain with the Ordenanza del Patronazgo (1574).[30] Yet even among the regular orders there was contention and competition concerning doctrinal matters and jurisdictional claims. First to arrive in 1524, the Franciscans claimed for themselves the most prominent Nahua *altepetl* (Nahua sociopolitical unit). The subsequent arrivals of the Dominicans and the Augustinians would challenge Franciscan hegemony and dominance and lead to numerous conflicts—particularly between Dominicans and Franciscans—over who controlled which territory and doctrinal matters.[31] As will be seen (particularly in Chapter 2) differences and tensions among and between secular and regular ecclesiastics spilled over into the production of religious texts and contributed to their variation.

The general novelty of the "New World" opened up a wide variety of debates regarding its evangelization. In response, Mexico City and Mérida hosted various synods and councils to guide the establishment of Catholicism. Some, such as the first synod in 1524, concerned the administration of the sacraments particularly baptism. Others, such as the Second and Third Mexican Provincial Councils of 1565 and 1585, and the Yucatecan synod of 1722 studied how to apply reforms introduced by the Council of Trent in New Spain. But all considered the uniform instruction and practice of Catholicism a major concern, and most dealt in some way with regulating the production of native-language religious texts to prevent the creation of various versions of Catholicism.

Events in Europe also influenced religious texts produced in colonial central Mexico and Yucatan. In response to the spiritual backsliding of the Church made evident by figures such as Martin Luther and Ulrich Zwingli, the Church held the Council of Trent from 1545 to 1563. The primary concern of the Council was to redefine its position on various doctrines, and to establish uniformity throughout the Church. As a result of Trent, various religious texts emerged, including the *Catechismus Romanus* in 1566 and the revised *Missale Romanum* in 1570. Moreover, other texts, particularly those with Erasmian and humanist sympathies felt the scrutiny of the Inquisition and a Tridentine

[30] Also, the regular clergy were subject to superiors and generals beyond Spain, usually Rome. This made them more independent, and the Ordenanza was an effort to bring them under greater royal control. For a more detailed account, see John F. Schwaller, *The Church and Clergy in Sixteenth-Century Mexico* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1987). Portions of my discussion on the clergy also appeared in Mark Z. Christensen, "Clergy-Secular," in *Encyclopedia of Latin America*, ed. J. Michael Francis, vol. 1 (Washington, DC: Facts on File, 2009).

[31] Gibson, *The Aztecs*, 105–14. For more on the conflicts between and within orders, see Ricard, *Spiritual Conquest*, 239–63.

conservatism. The effects of such reforms and texts on native-language religious texts are referenced throughout the book.

As the Bourbons came to power in 1700, and spurred on by their loss in the Seven Years War (1756–1763), the efficiency-oriented Bourbon state viewed the Church as a financial asset to fill its coffers, thus initiating a rift between the laity and the clergy and the Church and the state.[32] The expulsion of the Jesuits, the reigning in of the regular orders and the roles of native assistants, and the secularization of parishes are accents in the Bourbon assault on the Church and affected the production of printed religious texts. In many ways, the Bourbon reforms reflected broader intellectual reforms in Europe that had already began to affect the Church. By the mid-seventeenth century, European religious texts betrayed a reformed style emphasizing simplicity and clarity over earlier Baroque rhetoric that evangelized through awakening the emotions.[33] Although many religious texts in New Spain similarly preferred simplicity to complex eloquence by the mid-seventeenth century, I see this more of a result of ecclesiastics negotiating with everyday issues of colonial society than strictly top-down reform. Yet perhaps the Bourbon effects are clearest in central Mexico where Jesuits and secular clerics largely monopolized the production of Nahuatl texts by the mid-eighteenth century. After the expulsion of the Jesuits in 1767, the production of printed Nahuatl texts drastically diminishes and is dominated by the secular clergy.

Importantly, and similar to what the "New Conquest History" has done for the roles of natives as Indian Conquistadors, this book provides a deeper appreciation for the role of Nahuas and Mayas in the evangelization of Mesoamerica.[34] Behind nearly every Nahuatl and Maya religious text lay a native assistant. These assistants played varied roles, from scribes to ghostwrit-

[32] See Brian Larkin, *The Very Nature of God: Baroque Catholicism and Religious Reform in Bourbon Mexico City* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 2010) for interesting insights on the decline of Baroque Catholicism's performative piety and an emphasis on understanding the doctrine. See also D.A. Brading, *Church and State in Bourbon Mexico: The Diocese of Michoacán 1749–1810* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994); Matthew D. O'Hara, *A Flock Divided: Race, Religion, and Politics in Mexico, 1749–1857* (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2010). For the effects of the Bourbon Reforms on the Yucatec Maya, see Nancy Farriss's *Maya Society under Colonial Rule: The Collective Enterprise of Survival* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1984), 355–88; and on central Mexico, see Taylor, *Magistrates.*

[33] For an interesting study on sermons and their evolution, see Joris Van Eijnatten, ed., *Preaching, Sermon, and Cultural Change in the Long Eighteenth Century* (Lieden: Brill, 2009).

[34] For an overview of the "New Conquest History," see Susan Schroeder, "Introduction: The Genre of Conquest Studies," in *Indian Conquistadors: Indigenous Allies in the Conquest of Mesoamerica*, ed. Laura E. Matthew and Michel R. Oudijk (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 2007).

ers to authors. Surely it is not a coincidence that the decline of schools promoting Nahuatl text production, such as the College of Tlatelolco, paralleled the decline in lengthy, eloquent Nahuatl religious texts used for doctrinal instruction. Nahuas and Mayas also served as the representatives of Catholicism in their towns during the frequent absence of the priest. Thus, although Spaniards played a large role in disseminating and shaping Catholicism, Nahuas and Mayas played an equal if not larger role—a role exposed through the religious texts examined here.

Finally, the chapters afford insights into the influence of time and location vis-à-vis centers and peripheries on the texts themselves. The nuanced differences between sixteenth- and late eighteenth-century texts become increasingly apparent—whether through the loss of millenarian or Baroque rhetoric, shortened texts, or changing vocabulary or doctrine. Frequent references in the texts themselves to the differences between centers and peripheries, and the distinction between the Catholicism preached and practiced in central Mexico and that of peripheral Yucatan also draw attention to the impact centers and peripheries had on the versions of Catholicism. Moreover, the peripheries, particularly in Yucatan, provided solace and security for native authors to create unauthorized texts.

Myriad other aspects of colonial life can be seen through religious texts. Volumes can be written on how native-language religious texts represent such topics as gender, race, and class, to name a few, and how each affects such literary works. Yet a detailed analysis of such topics lies beyond the scope of this book. Instead, the book focuses on illustrating the various Catholicisms Nahuatl and Maya religious texts both prescribed and reflected, and how these texts and versions came about, a subject to which we now turn.